Research Article

PERFORMANCE EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL MANAGERS OF HIGH SCHOOLS OF QUDS PROVINCE

*Fatemeh Asadi

Department of Education, Educational Management Field, Azad Islamic University, Islamshahr Branch, Islamshahr, Iran *Author for Correspondence

ABSTRACT

The purpose of the present study was to evaluate the performance of educational managers of high schools of Quds province due to administrative tasks of Fayol. Research is "descriptive" in terms of data collection and is kind of a survey. The tool for gathering data was the questionnaire of managers' performance. Questionnaire's reliability was calculated 0.78 using Cronbach's alpha method. The statistical population of this research was all high schools principals of Quds province that 110 people were selected using the staged classified sampling method. Data were analyzed using SPSS. The research findings, by calculating the Pearson correlation coefficients and P<0.01, suggested that there is a significant relation between the factors of planning, coordinating, leadership, organizing and control and the performance of managers of high schools of Quds province; and Fayol five tasks are evident in the performance of high schools' managers of Quds province.

Keywords: Managers' Performance, Planning, Organizing, Ordering, Coordinating, Control

INTRODUCTION

We all have witnessed great advances in different fields of science, technology and changes in methods and the way of using resources. These developments and changes are going on faster than before in human life. The mentioned changes have formed a new way in the lifestyle and the way of dealing with issues and have affected all factors of success or failure. We are living in an age that is based on revolutions and changes in all aspects of life. Ecological revolution, the revolution of materials, digital revolution, and more importantly, the information spread are beside and in front of us (Sarabadani, 2012). Undoubtedly, the business will have a new concept in the future with these changes. Education industry, management, transportation, banking, publishing, telecommunications and so on will be fundamentally changed and will find a new form.

The increasing changes in today's world that is the information and communication era, and due to instability and variability and unpredictable nature of these changes as well, taking advantage of opportunities in competition with other countries is what that helps the countries especially the developing countries in order to increase productivity and improvement and development; while this would not be possible without the wisdom and creativity of managers and also the influence of managers on fostering the creativity of employees who work together for the growth and development of their organization and therefore the wider community (Sarabadani, 2012).

The most important and most fundamental changes can be referred to the performance of management, as the feedback of the actions of a manager not only affect the performance of teachers, but also has a direct effect on the success or failure of students. Undoubtedly what is affecting the performance of managers is creativity and providing new ideas to further educational goals and objectives. According to the Fayol theory, educational management can provide a suitable environment for the growth and development using the best teachers and in order to achieve the educational objectives. A successful manager, in the first place, must have a proper control on planning, organizing factors involved in education, coordinating these factors in order to succeed in his management and achieve the educational purposes.

Research Background

Roshanzamir (2007), in a study investigated on the "Evaluation the consideration level to the Fayol fourteen principles by the managers of Tarom District ". The findings showed that five tasks of

Research Article

management due to the Fayol fourteen principles have a significant relationship with the performance of managers.

Esfahani (2008), in a study investigated on the "Managers' performance evaluation in all five districts of Isfahan city and the "J" region based on the administrative tasks of Fayol". The findings stated the fact that the performance of managers is based on the Fayol fourteen principles.

Nickanjam (2009), in a study investigated on the "Assessment of compliance of educational managers' performance with the five tasks of Fayol due to the of teachers' point of view in each of the three levels of education in Hamedan city". Some findings include: increasing academic degrees and taking management courses contributed to better performance management. There is a significant difference in performance between male and female managers.

Habibi and Zabet (2011), in a study entitled as "Investigating the impact of performance evaluation on the development of human resources in the police headquarters," concluded that the assessment of performance of the police headquarters affects motivation, satisfaction and retention of human resources.

Karimian *et al.*, (2014), in a study entitled as "the assessment of organizational performance based on human resources management using the fuzzy multi-criteria decision-making techniques of organizations depended to the municipality of Isfahan" concluded that indicators of Human Resource Planning, Performance Assessment, Recruitment, Selection, Training and Development achieved the highest ranks, respectively.

Babaei *et al.*, (2015), in a study entitled as "Evaluating the managerial skills and determining the functional barriers for head nurses based on Performance Evaluation Model" with the aim of determining managerial skills and their functional barriers in different dimensions, concluded that the managerial performance of head nurses have poorly defined and the greatest obstacles of functionality in program implementation were the shortage of funds and lack of awareness of duties.

Edwards (2003), in a study entitled as "Factors affecting the quality of schools' curriculum" using a questionnaire concluded that management styles, educational factors, structure and content of textbooks, teachers' performance and the effectiveness of their activities are the most important factors affecting the quality of schools' curriculum.

Henry (2004), the American researcher, implemented different styles of management in small groups as an experimental study with the assumption that authoritarian leadership has more impact than other methods of management on the group or organization (Advisory, Authoritarian, Participatory). The findings showed that in the participatory management staff morale is higher and the quality of productivity is better and the satisfaction of manager is greater (Quoted from Sarabadani, 2012).

Albert (2007), the American researcher, studied a survey from teachers in some primary and high schools in a research and investigated the managers' performance. The findings showed that the managers' beliefs, their knowledge and their commitment to their words are factors that can be effective on the students' improvement and their achievement to the objectives.

Skinner and Green (2010), in a study entitled as "Elements of effective performance evaluation" concluded that performance assessment is one of the important tools.

Shane (2011), in a study entitled as "Factors affecting curriculums in primary schools" concluded that: the best factor to improve the quality of educational programs is to consider the demands of children and adapting the content of curriculums according to their mental and physical needs and the performance coordination of managers with the changes of curriculums to meet the needs of the school. He stated that when the course is enjoyable for children, they pay more attention to the lesson and the teacher will have more productivity (Quoted from Sarabadani, 2011).

Lympman (2012), in a study entitled as "four steps and effective performance evaluation" stated the stages of an effective performance evaluation.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The research methodology was a descriptive survey. It can also be useful due to the assessment of Managers' performance. An applied research is a research in which that uses the results of basic

Research Article

researches to improve and make the behaviors, methods, tools, equipment, products, structures and patterns used in the human communities perfect. The aim of the practical research is to develop the practical knowledge in a special field. In other words, practical researches are led towards scientific applications.

In order to evaluate the performance of managers, the questionnaire of managers' performance is used. This questionnaire was to evaluate the activities of managers, so it was given to the managers and deputies in order to evaluate the performance of managers of schools.

The questionnaire consisted of 30 questions. This questionnaire was approved by M. Sarabadani in 2011, in the MA thesis. To determine the reliability of the methods in this study, the Cronbach's Alpha was used and in order to ensure the validity of the questionnaire, the questionnaire of study was given first to 5 professors and they were asked about their opinions. After asking the opinions of professors, it was determined that the questionnaire has the required validity.

This questionnaire was given to 10 participants of the study for trial, and the reliability and validity of the questionnaire was calculated 0.78 after calculations and using the Cronbach's alpha coefficient.

The sampling method was staged classified. In the first phase, high schools were selected among the schools of Quds province. In the second phase, the total number of principals of high schools were calculated, the number of principals of high schools in Quds province were 55, that because of the small population and in order to promote some parts to the results of the study, a deputy was also randomly selected from each schools. So the sample size in this study was 110.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The analysis of collected data was considered as a bridge to achieve the results of research. In this study, to analyze the data, the descriptive statistical techniques such as tables and charts and correlation coefficients were used and in order to evaluate and determine the strength of predicting the performance of managers by each of the five tasks of Fayol, the multiple regression analysis was used and data were analyzed by SPSS.

A) Descriptive Statistics: the descriptive indicators of scores of managers' performance were calculated and the results are presented in Table 1.

The least frequency related to diploma and PhD, 0 percent and the highest frequency related to MA, 64 percent. The mean for bachelor was 18 percent (Table 1).

The least frequency related to PhD, 0 percent and the highest frequency related to MA, 53.1 percent and the mean for bachelor was 29.4 percent (Table 2).

According to Table 3, the frequency of working experience of managers is as follows: between 1-5 years, 2 people; between 6-10 years, 5 people; between 11-15 years, 18 people; between 16-20 years, 18 people; between 21-25 years, 10 people; between 26-30 years, 2 people; and the highest frequency was related to the working experience between 11-15 years.

According to Table 4, the frequency of working experience of deputies is as follows: between 1-5 years, 8 people; between 6-10 years, 20 people; between 11-15 years, 15 people; between 16-20 years, 5 people; between 21-25 years, 2 people; between 26-30 years, 3 people; and the highest frequency was related to the working experience between 11-15 years.

Educational	Level of Frequency		Frequency Percentage Abundance Rally		
Managers Diploma		0	0	0	
Bachelor		18	36	36	
MA		37	64	64	
Ph.D.		0	0	100	
Total		55	100		

 Table 1: Frequency of managers in terms of their educational level

Research Article

Table 2. Frequency of deputies in terms of educational Lever							
Educational Level	Frequency	Frequency Percenta	ge Abundance Rally				
Diploma	10	17.5	17.5				
Associate Degree	14	29.4	46.9				
MA	31	53.1	100				
Ph.D.	0	0	100				
Total	55	100					

Table 2: Frequency of deputies in terms of educational Level

Table 3: Frequency and Frequency Percentage in terms of Working Experience of Managers

Work Experience of managers	Frequency	Frequency	Abundance Rally
		Percentage	
Between 1-5 years	2	4	4
Between 6-10 years	5	10	14
Between 11-15 years	18	36	50
Between 16-20 years	18	26	76
Between 21-25 years	10	20	96
Between 26-30 years	2	4	100
Total	55	100	

Table 4: Frequency and frequency percentages based on working experience of deputies

Work Experience of Deputies	Frequency	Frequency Percentage Abundance Rally			
Between 5-1 years	8	13.4	13.4		
Between 10-6 years	20	33.4	46.8		
Between 15-11 years	15	39.1	85.9		
Between 20-16Sal	5	8.4	94.3		
Between 25-21 years	2	4.1	98.4		
Between 30-26Sal	3	1.6	100		
Total	55	100			

B) Inferential Statistics

To test the hypotheses, Pearson's correlation coefficient was used to calculate the correlation coefficient between the five tasks based on questionnaire's data and the performance of managers.

First hypothesis: There is a significant difference between the managers' performance and planning.

The results of Table 5 showed that considering the calculated correlation coefficients R=0.217, there is a significant difference between the managers' performance and planning at P<0.01. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a relationship between managers' performance and planning, and this is a direct and positive relationship.

Variables	Students
Managers' Performance - Planning	0.217

The second hypothesis: There is a significant difference between the managers' performance and organizing school affairs.

The results of Table 6 showed that considering the calculated correlation coefficients R=0.206, there is a significant difference between the managers' performance and organizing school affairs at P<0.01. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a relationship between managers' performance and organizing school affairs, and this is a direct and positive relationship.

Research Article

 Table 6: The results of correlation coefficient for managers' performance and organizing school affairs

Variables	Students
Managers' Performance - organizing school affairs	0.206

The third hypothesis: There is a significant difference between the managers' performance and teachers ordering.

The results of Table 7 showed that considering the calculated correlation coefficients R=0.130, there is a significant difference between the managers' performance and teachers ordering at P<0.01. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a relationship between managers' performance and teachers ordering, and this is a direct and positive relationship.

Table 7: The results of correlation coefficient for managers' performance and ordering

Variables	Students
Managers' Performance – Teachers Ordering	0.130

The fourth hypothesis: There is a significant difference between the managers' performance and teachers' coordination.

The results of Table 8 showed that considering the calculated correlation coefficients R=0.126, there is a significant difference between the managers' performance and teachers' coordination at P<0.01. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a relationship between managers' performance and teachers' coordination, and this is a direct and positive relationship.

Table 8: The results of correlation coefficient for managers' performance and coordination Variables Students

Variables	Students
Managers' Performance - Teachers' Coordination	0.126

Fifth hypothesis: There is a significant difference between the managers' performance and controlling school affairs.

The results of Table 9 showed that considering the calculated correlation coefficients R=0.124, there is a significant difference between the managers' performance and controlling school affairs at P<0.01. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a relationship between managers' performance and controlling school affairs, and this is a direct and positive relationship.

In order to investigate and determine the predictive power of managers' performance using each of the five tasks of Fayol, the multiple regression analysis was used.

These data of Table 10 showed that the research hypothesis is significant at F=0.217. The orientation of predictive planning of managers' performance is direct and positive (β =0.197, P<0.01).

These data of Table 11 showed that the research hypothesis is significant at F=0.130. The orientation of predictive ordering of managers' performance is direct and positive (β =0.195, P<0.01).

These data Table 12 showed that the research hypothesis is significant at F=0.206. The orientation of predictive organizing of managers' performance is direct and positive (β =0.191, P<0.01).

These data of Table 13 showed that the research hypothesis is significant at F=0.126. The orientation of predictive coordination of managers' performance is direct and positive (β =0.195, P<0.01).

These data of Table 13 showed that the research hypothesis is significant at F=0.214. The orientation of predictive controlling school affairs of managers' performance is direct and positive (β =0.195, P<0.01).

Table 9: The results of correlation coefficient for managers' performance and controlling school affairs

Variables	Students
Managers' Performance - Controlling school affairs	0.124

Research Article

Table 10: The results of predicting the regression analysis of planning on the performance of the managers

Former variables	R	Adjusted R square	F Level	Significance level	The regression coefficient β	t value	Significance level of p
Managers' Performance 0.001	0.63	0.396	0.217	0.001	0.58	8.02	-
Planning 0.005					0.197	2.23	-

Table 11: The results of predicting the regression analysis of ordering on the performance of the managers

Former variables	R	Adjusted R square	F Level	Significance level	The regression coefficient β	t value	Significance level of p
Managers' Performance	0.67	0.449	0.130	0.001	0.55	8.12	
0.001							
Planning					0.195	.84	0.005
0.005							

Table 12: The results of predicting the regression analysis of organizing on the performance of the managers

Former variables	R	Adjusted R square	F Level	The significance level	The regression coefficient β	t value	Significance level of p
Managers' Performance	0.62	0.384	0.206	0.001	0.54	8.12	
0.001							
Organizing					0.191	2.17	0.005

Table 13: The results of predicting the regression analysis of coordination on the performance of the managers

Former variables	R	Adjusted R square	F Level	The significance level	The regression coefficient β	t value	Significance level of p
Managers' Performance	0.67	0.449	0.126	0.001	0.55	8.12	
0.001							
Coordination					0.195	2.84	0.005

Research Article

Table 14: The results of predicting the regu	ression analysis of controlling school affairs on the
performance of the managers	

Former variables	R	Adjusted R square	F Level	The significance level	The regression coefficient β	t value	Significance level of p
Managers' Performance 0.001	0.62	0.384	0.214	0.001	0.54	8.12	
Controlling School Affairs					0.191	2.17	0.005

Conclusion

Management is one of the essential needs of development; especially it is necessary in schools, because the education of the young generation to have a healthy society is very important. With correct and appropriate management, we can get the possible benefits from hidden talents and the individuals' potential, and actualize the potential for growth and prosperity. Therefore, it is necessary to evaluate the performance of managers and executives; and according to research findings that investigated the performance of managers of high schools of Quds province based on the five tasks of Fayol, it concluded that each of the five determined tasks for a manager is good and powerful, necessary and proper. The findings concluded that principals of high schools act based on the five tasks Fayol and consider these five components in their management and thus they have successful management.

After investigating the first hypothesis, it found out that there is significant relationship between the managers' performance and planning that is significant at P<0.01 and the relationship between planning and managers' performance is direct and positive. Managers who have accurate and regular planning in the school affairs, have well and more efficient performance in their school and this also can increase the feedback of their activities. The results of this study were consistent with the results of Esfahani (2008)'s study that the performance of managers is according to the Fayol duties.

After investigating the second hypothesis, it found out that there is significant relationship between the managers' performance and organizing that is significant at P<0.01 and the relationship between organizing and managers' performance is direct and positive. Managers, who have a strong organizing power in school's affairs due to the needs and priorities of school, have appropriate and considerable performance. The results of this study were consistent with the results of Joseph Jozan (2002).

After investigating the third hypothesis, it found out that there is significant relationship between the managers' performance and ordering that is significant at P<0.01 and the relationship between ordering and managers' performance is direct and positive. After having a good and strong planning, and the organization of schools, having the power of a superior command is necessary for management. Managers, who benefit from this feature, have a high managerial performance. The results of this study were consistent with the results of Nickanjam (2009)'s study.

After investigating the fourth hypothesis, it found out that there is significant relationship between the managers' performance and coordination that is significant at P<0.01 and the relationship between coordination and managers' performance is direct and positive. Managers, who have a high power of coordination in connecting students and teachers, and the coordination of teachers' working hours and all the internal affairs of school, have a well and considerable performance. Wasting time and untimely interference of program with each other will be avoided using coordination.

After investigating the he fifth assumption, it found out that there is significant relationship between the managers' performance and the control of school's affairs that is significant at P<0.01 and the relationship between the control of school's affairs and managers' performance is direct and positive. There is always a confrontation and interaction between teachers, students and other school factors; extra hours for teaching and needed accessories for students require management observation and control. Thus, managers who have control of schools' affairs, have a high performance. The results of this study

Research Article

were consistent with the results of studies of Esfahani (2008), Nickanjam (2009) and Williams (2004) is consistent.

Recommendations

- Since planning is the most important factor in management, it is recommended to use managers who implement their objectives with correct plans.

- Ordering requires strength in behavior and expression for managers, thus it is appropriate not to appoint passive people, of course, flexibility is needed in order to participate in management.

- To boost organizational morale and proper control of school's affairs, it is recommended to hold briefing and training courses in order to choose well deserving managers.

- Given the significance of planning and performance of managers, it is recommended to use the opinions of teachers and deputies for the successful planning and consider participation in order to further interaction with factors in their agenda.

- Due to the significance of leadership in this study with the performance of managers, it is recommended to avoid absolute tyranny characteristic in commanding in affairs while maintaining the authority in order to increase the optimal performance of management with the collaboration of all factors.

REFERENCES

Abzari M and Seraydarian H (2008). Organizational Behavior Management (Organization, Management and Organizational Behavior) and Practical Attitudes (Isfahan: Research Process Company).

Abili K (2003). An analysis on the effectiveness of employee evaluation system. *Journal of Knowledge Management* 58.

Abolalaei B (2011). Performance Management: A Guide for Managers to Evaluate and Improve the Performance of Employees (Tehran: Industrial Management Institute).

Azar A and Momeni M (2011). *The Statistics and its Application in Management*, tenth edition (Tehran: Samt Publication) 1.

Azarhoosh F (2011). The Management of Complex Organizations fifth edition (Tehran: Industrial Management Institute).

Esfahani M (2008). Evaluation of the performance of managers in five districts of Isfahan city and the region G based on the administrative tasks of Fayol, Master Thesis, Islamic Azad University, Central Tehran Branch.

Alvani M (2008). Public Management (Ney Publication) Tehran.

Iran Nejad Parizi M (2004). Organization and Management from Theory to Practice (Mizan Publication) Tehran.

Iran Nejad Parizi M (2000). Research Methods and Social Science (Mizan Publication) Tehran.

Babaei Poor M, Amrollahi F and Firouzkoohi MR (2015). Evaluating the managerial skills and determining the functional barriers for head nurses based on Performance Evaluation Model of Bares, Rasht.

Behrangi M (1969). Education and School Management (Tehran: Kamale Tarbiat Publication).

Paryani E (2008). The Evaluate of the performance of managers of high schools in Tehran, Master Thesis, Islamic Azad University, Central Tehran Branch.

Torabi M (2011). *Evaluating the Performance of School Principals* (Tehran: Scientific and cultural publication).

Tanhaei A (2002). Human Resources Management, *Journal of Management* (63, 64), (August and September).

Parkinson Rostoom J (2004). *Management Skills*, translated by Mehdi Iran nejad Parizi (Tehran: Azadeh Publication), Karaj: Management Education and Research Institute.

Pardakhtchi M (2002). Educational System as a Professional Domain (Tehran: Agah publication).

Habibi A and Zabet MR (2011). The impact of performance evaluation on the development of human resources in the police headquarters. *Journal of Pars Manager*.

Research Article

Khaki G (2003). A Guide to Define and Critique the Research (Tehran: Islamic Azad University, the center of scientific publications).

Rahmani Z (2009). Outstanding Managers Pattern of Behavior: the Study of Behavior and Performance of Effective and Successful Managers, second edition (Sari: Publication center of development of science).

Roshanzamir A (2007). Evaluation the consideration level to the Fayol fourteen principles by the managers of Tarom District, MA thesis, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon Branch.

Sarabadani M (2012). Evaluating the performance of high schools managers of Quds city.

Sekaran U (2003). *Methodology in Management*, first edition, translated by Saebi M and Shirazi (Tehran: Public Administration Training Centre).

Seif A (1992). Psychology of Learning and Teaching (Tehran: Agah Publication).

Shariat Panahi A (2002). Learning Management (Tehran: Asatir Publication).

Shams P (2007). Investigating the participative management and its effectiveness on the work of teachers, master's thesis, Tehran University

Shirazi MH (2000). Introduction of Educational Management, first edition (Tehran: Asatir Publication).

Safi A (2002). Management in Education, first edition (Tehran: Education publication).

Asipour MJ (2007). Management Theories (Tehran: Miremad Publication).

Asgarian A (2006). Relations between Managers and Students (Tehran Rozaneh Publication).

Ghaffarian V (2011). Management Competencies (Tehran: Industrial Management Institute).

Karimian M, Safari S and Khosravi A (2014). The assessment of organizational performance based on human resources management using the fuzzy multi-criteria decision-making techniques of organizations depended to the municipality of Isfahan.

Mohammadi A (2010). *The Standardization of Performance of Training Managers*, Tehran: Islamic Azad University, Central Tehran Branch.

Molana N (2002). Management Skills and the management of educational environments. *Journal of Management* (48) (April, May).

Naderi A (2007). The performance of educational managers of high schools of Tabriz based on Fayol principals, Master Thesis, Islamic Azad University Tabriz Branch.

Nickanjam Z (2009). Assessment of compliance of educational managers' performance with the five tasks of Fayol due to the of teachers' point of view in each of the three levels of education in Hamedan city.

Wiles K (1999). *Management and Educational Leadership*, translated by Mohammad Ali Toosi (Tehran: Public Administration Training Centre).

Vatan, D.A.; S. Kim S, C. (2002). *Fostering Management Skills: Employees' Motivation*, translated by Mehdi Iran nejad Parizi, Tehran: Institute for Research and Management Education.

Bernardin HJ (2003). *Human Resource Management: An Experiential Approach*, third edition (New York: Mc GrawHill).

Byars LI and Rue LW (2008). Human Resource Management, 9th edition (New York: Mc GrawHill).

Carell Micheal R et al., (1992). Personnel / Human Resource Management (Mac Millan. Publishing).

Edvardez A Hollenbeck (2009). *Human Resource Management: Gaining Competitive Advantage* (New York: Mc Grawhill).

Foot M and Hook C (1999). Introducing Human Resource Management (Longman).

Finger R (2006). Public Sector Performance appraisal effectiveness: A Case Study. *Public Personnel Management* 25(2).

Gordon Judith R (1993). Organizational Behaviorally & Bacon.

Hartland Clinton O and Nykodym N (2010). Public Sector Performance appraisal effectiveness: A Case Study. *Public Personnel Management* 25(2).

Ivancevich JM (2007). Human Resource Management (New York: Mc GrawHill).

Kaldwell M and Overili O (1996). Public Sector Performance appraisal effectiveness: A Case Study. *Public Personnel Management* 25(7).

Research Article

Kotter J (1999). What effective General Managers Really do. Harvard Business Review.

Kontez M (2003). What effective General Manangers Really do. Harvard Business Review.

Kantez MA (2002). Public Sector Performance appraisal effectiveness: A Case Study. *Public Personnel Management* 25(2).

Lotanz FA (2001). Public Sector Performance appraisal effectiveness: A Case Study. *Public Personnel Management* 26(9).

Lipman V (2012). Four Steps and Effective Performance Evaluation.

Noe RA, Hollenbeck JR, Gerhurt B and Wright PM (2008). *Human Resource Management: Gaining Competitive Advantage* (New York: Mc Grawhill).

Niycher D (2009). Human Resource Management, 3rd edition (New York: Mc GrawHill).

Pelatoo (2006). An Introduction to Human Resource Management (Elsevier Ltd.).

Robertson Gary E and Pavlak T (2007). Municipal government Personnwl Professional and Performance appraisal: Is there a consensus on the Characteristics of an effective appraisal system? *Public Personnel Management* **25**(3).

Richard Smit (2008). Public Sector Performance appraisal effectiveness: A Case Study. *Public Personnel Management* **25**(2).

Skinner J and Green R (2010). The Elements of an Effective Performance Appraisal.

Snell SA and Bohlander GW (2007). *Managing Human Resources* (Thomson Publishing Company). **Woovdal M (2006).** *Human Resource Management*, 9th edition (New York: Mc GrawHill).